

Question 11. Read the poem “R. Alcona to J. Brenzaida” (“Cold in the earth ...”) by Emily Jane Bronte on page 9 of the Source Booklet.

Explore the ways in which grief is presented in this poem and one other poem from your prescribed list.

In your answer, you must consider relevant contextual factors.

16

Grief is an emotion of extreme misery and sadness which is usually driven by something or the loss of someone in the poems. In “R Alconato to J Brenzaida” by Emily Bronte and “Ode to Melancholy” by John Keats grief is presented in different ways. Bronte sees grief as despair and something one must escape from. On the contrary Keats interprets grief as an inevitable stage in life that we should experience and appreciate more.

The background of each poem tells grief in a different way. Bronte created the Gondal Saga which is a fictional world with fictional characters like the ones mentioned in the poem “R Alcona to J Brenzaida”. Many people believe she created this world as an escapism from grief in the real world since she lost family members at a young age. Immersing in the fictional world allows her to escape from the pain in real life as a way to channel her grief through the characters’ grief. In a similar way Keats channels his grief through writing. However he sees grief as something people should enjoy and experience it to the fullest. According to critic Johnson, romantic poetry is a way to show “the complex connection of pleasure and pain” which is supported by Keats finding pleasure in pain.

The settings of both poems give a dramatic effect on presenting the theme of grief. In the Bronte poem pathetic fallacy is used. “Cold in the earth” refers to the snow covered ground Brenzaida is buried in. The word cold can be interpreted as lifelessness and emotionless. Alcona feels detached and lifeless as her lover Brenzaida is gone. The feeling of grief has taken over her as her “only love” is “severed at last by Time’s all-wearing wave.” The soil on the ground has separated the lovers like how death has separated them from each other.

The line “cold in the earth” is again repeated in the third stanza. It shows the eternal coldness and grief she is feeling despite the passing of time through “fifteen wild Decembers”. The anaphora in stanza 5 “no other sun...” with “no other star” and “All my life’s bliss...” in the last two lines gives an illusion of listing many things. Words like “sun” and “heaven” create a sense of transcendency, meaning that even the metaphysical beings can’t give her life back because it dies along with Brenzaida.

In Keats’ poem, a lighter tone is used as he uses a lot of Greek mythology diction like “Lethe” a river of forgetfulness, “Wolf’s bane” a poison, “Proserpine” a Greek Goddess etc. A more lively and warm atmosphere can be interpreted through the use of words like “ruby grapes” “yew berries” “beetle” “rose” and “peonies”. These nature related words create a vastly different settings with the Bronte poem, which is dark, cold and mysterious, showing the differences in how both poets view “grief”.

Bronte sees grief as human's worst enemy. Keats sees grief as something that "dwells with beauty", which he personifies as "she". He thinks we should treat grief as a "mistress" to whom we should "emprison her soft hand" "let her rave" and "feed deep, deep, upon her peerless eyes." Keats means that we should embrace her as if she has "soft hands" which shows "her" sign of welcoming; let grief take control and enjoy the beauty of the feeling of grief and melancholy as in "let her rave" and finally submit to her through her "peerless eyes". Humans often have difficulty rejecting some emotions like jealousy, anger and grief. To Keats, it is easier to just submit to it. The long "e" sound in "deep" "feed" and "peerless" gives a sense of mysteriousness. We never know what grief is like until we submit to it and stop trying to run from it. In a different way, Bronte embodies the death of Brenzaida into "grief". Alcona fears she might forget about him as she did not know "existence could be cherished, strengthened and fed without the aid of joy". The triad "cherished" "strengthened" and "fed" creates a strong sense of passion she has lost. There is a saying that "time heals everything" which means that over time the pain will fade away. In Bronte's view "time makes you forget" that is why the pain fades, because it is hidden and locked away as she said "Dare not indulge in Memory's rapturous pain" and "drinking deep of that divinest anguish" meaning not remembering and keeping drinking to drown the grief to make herself whole again. She no longer feels the hopelessness and grief but at the same time she would never know the feeling again as she said "how could I seek the empty world again?" meaning after she has returned to normal without grief, why would she want to feel the grief and pain again, conveying the idea of escapism.

Powerful emotion is one of the main themes in romantic poetry. In both poems the powerful emotion of grief is presented. In romantic poet William Wordsworth's Preface to the Lyrical Ballads he mentions that "poetry is the spontaneous overflowing of powerful feeling. It takes its origin from strong emotion recollected in tranquillity." It means that romantic poetry involves channelling "strong emotion recollection" into the gentle and sublime "tranquillity". Bronte channels her grief into poetry in a similar way. She writes about Alcona locking away her emotions. Keats channels his grief into poetry who writes about his personal feelings, accepting grief and finding the beauty in expressing grief. Both poets deal with grief differently, through escaping and accepting, but at the end, the aim is to search for something tranquil and peaceful. In Bronte's poem she calls grief a "useless passion" completely ignoring grief and turns to denial and finds peace where she said "weaned my young soul from yearning after thine" to stop thinking about him and just move on. In Keats' poem he elevates the importance and status of melancholy by capitalizing the letter "M" and using the words "shrine", "trophies". He admires grief and turns the misery into something beautiful which is shown in the imagery of "burst Joy's grape" and "His soul shall taste" etc.

The structure of both poems contributes to the theme of grief. Both poems are written in iambic pentameter which sustains a melodic flow in the poem, suggesting how grief can turn into something tranquil. Bronte's poems have a relatively regular rhyming scheme of ABAB. It again creates a melodic flow to the poem and also depicts the sense of regularity in how someone should get over grief step by step. On the contrary in Keats' poem the rhyming scheme is not regular but there are a few pairs of rhymes like "cloud" and "shroud" "sand-

wave” and “rave” etc. It elicits a sense of unknown as if he did not know what accepting grief means as well, but hints of beauty, the faint hints of rhyme, may surface.

In conclusion both poets successfully portray the theme of grief, in which is presented in a different way. Bronte chooses to escape and Keats chooses to embrace, but at the end both find peace and tranquillity.

Question 6. “To an extent, the audience sympathises with Hamlet’s disturbed view of the world.”

In the light of this comment, explore Shakespeare’s presentation of the causes of Hamlet’s “madness”.

In your answer, you must consider relevant contextual factors. 24

Shakespeare’s presentation of Hamlet’s madness stands on four key causes: primarily the catalyst of the plot which is the murder of his father, his introspective nature, as a way to express the character more fully and the underlying socio-political conflict shrouding Denmark and global scientific discoveries.

It is not so much the killing of Hamlet’s father that drives him into madness so much as the void created in his absence that Hamlet feels is his duty to fill. As Ernest Jones observes, Hamlet’s preoccupation with killing Claudius may spring from his Oedipus Complex as Claudius, in killing his father and marrying his mother has successfully fulfilled Hamlet’s own desires, and in killing Claudius Hamlet kills a part of himself. No more are these desires as keenly presented by Shakespeare as in 3.4. The scene is set in the queen’s “closet” (a small private room) however many productions including Kenneth Branagh’s have set the scene in a bedroom instead to emphasise the sexual tension running between the two characters. Hamlet immediately begins to chastise his mother taking on the role of an Elizabethan husband, “in the rank sweat of thy enseamed bed, stewed in corruption... the nasty sty”. Hamlet’s sibilance here helps to express the disgust he feels as he accuses his mother of doing wrong. The use of the word “rank” links to the motif of sickness that peppers the play as his mother’s actions are compared to the onset of a disease. This concept is reiterated as the queen repents in a way “Thou turn’st my eyes into my very soul... I see such black and grained spots.”

Shakespeare’s creation of the very character of Hamlet to be the protagonist in this revenge tragedy was a revolutionary idea, and one that significantly altered the state of Hamlet’s madness. Before we dive into that it is important to note that Hamlet is famously based on a far bloodier first draft called “Amleth”, where the protagonist was indeed the traditional rash revenger. However, in keeping with the genre of revenge, Shakespeare did add in a traditional revenge hero, one that was not present in “Amleth” – Laertes. Laertes is a foil to Hamlet and their reaction to the deaths of their loved ones are telling in the differences. Hamlet spends almost the entirety of the play in a static position compromised by the moral philosophy of revenge as shown through his various soliloquies. The problem of the ghost is

what triggers these issues. In Elizabethan protestant England ghosts were widely thought of as sprits from Hell and the idea of purgatory was discarded. We are led to believe Hamlet is protestant as he is educated in Wittenberg, the famous birthplace of protestant reformation. So in meeting the ghost that is “Doomed for a certain term to walk the night, and for the day confined to fast in fires” Hamlet (and the audiences of the time) have their religious beliefs thrown into question, as the ghost’s description of fasting, “fires” and walking of the night is an accurate description of the Catholic idea of Purgatory. As Hazlitt has famously noted “we are Hamlet”. We too are questioning our beliefs in watching Hamlet’s anguish. However to make the complex roundness of Hamlet more digestible Shakespeare employs Horatio who Bloom has observed to be an unfleshed out character, one whose role is to be an intermediary between the audience and Hamlet.

An additional cause of Hamlet’s madness is likely the dark ominous mood illustrated throughout the play. “Denmark is a prison” - the discerning comment from a Hamlet putting on an “antic disposition”. This mood is created from the very first scene, “Who’s there?” “Nay, answer me. Stand and unfold yourself.” The dialogue between the guards has irregular broken rhythm and abrupt sounding words working to create the uneasy mood that characterises the rest of the play. This type of atmosphere was likely inspired by events circulating around England at the time. From 1599 – 1601 (the time Hamlet was alleged to have been written) doubts about who was to succeed Elizabeth 1 after her peaceful 55 year reign were widespread, and the fact that England was sensitive to invasion from Spain, Ireland or Scotland was another looming threat. In 1.1 both of these are transmuted into Hamlet as Marcellus asks “Why such daily cast of brazen cannon / And foreign mart for implements of war?”, the “cannon” “foreign” “war” encapsulate the Elizabethans’ fear of impending political instability. More obviously, Fortinbras is symbolic of the feared foreign invader who is alluded to a few lines later - “Young Fortinbras ... to recover of us by strong hand ... those foresaid lands.” In this paranoid time it is no wonder Hamlet has succumbed to the cover of an “antic disposition”. Hyun-Lee has noted that Ophelia’s antic disposition allows her freedom from societal constraints to express her true desires, and in Hamlet we see similar logic as he can be seen to use his madness as a means of freedom of speech.

Ultimately Hamlet’s madness (whether feigned or not) retaliates against the various causes of his madness rather than remaining a simple effect through discriminating stream of conscious soliloquies, implying that he is an example of ruined potential that we, as audience members, should learn a lesson from, to avoid becoming the tragic heroes of our own revolutionary times.

Question 2 “It is a mistake to call ‘Measure for Measure’ a comedy because it tends to disturb audiences rather than make them laugh.”

In the light of this view, examine the extent to which the play might be considered a comedy.

In your answer, you must consider relevant contextual factors. 12 – should it be 10 or 11?

Written by William Shakespeare, “Measure for Measure” has been considered one of his best comedies. The play however presents some things that may lead the audience to be disturbed rather than laugh. So to what extent is “Measure for Measure” really a comedy?

Comedy was born in ancient Greece and the purpose of a comic play was to make people laugh by criticising daily life, politics and other things that took place in a society. In “Measure for Measure” indeed Shakespeare criticises the society and shows how laws are violated every day. The main theme of the play is justice and it is really beyond our understanding how Shakespeare could fit this so important theme in a play which is considered as comedy.

The play opens with the Duke wanting to leave Vienna to go and visit another king in another country. The trick is that he will go to Friar Peter and ask him for a disguise. He will return and see, as a monk, if the laws are really obeyed by the citizens of his city.

Vienna can remind us of Sodom, the city of sin, according to the bible. Even from Act 1 we can see that the city of Vienna is full of prostitutes and people have sex in brothels without having been married. This was considered a crime in Vienna, despite the fact that this is not the case in the era when Shakespeare writes the play. Until now we have not seen any comic elements. Inside this chaos there is a character who makes us forget the climate of the play. This character is Lucio, the fantastic, as Shakespeare refers to him in the play. This character works as a comic relief making the audience laugh when the situation becomes too dramatic. An example can be seen when Isabella goes to Angelo to ask him to release her brother. Lucio says to her to be more feminine and hotter making the audience think that is a sexual innuendo and provoking laughter. Although we know that Isabella wants to devote herself to God so she can't be very hot with men. Shakespeare, it is believed, didn't choose this name randomly as in English the word “Isabella” is translated as “Devoted to God” making the audience take the idea that this woman will stay loyal to her beliefs. Angelo in the beginning has refused to take the place of the Duke as he says that he may not be suitable for this place. As audience we can take that as a foreshadowing because we will see next that indeed he is not suitable for a leading role such as this,

In this part of the play there is a situation created that may disturb the audience, taking into consideration the beliefs of people in that time. Angelo claims that he wants to have sex with Isabella and he tells her that if she refuses he will kill her brother Claudio who is in prison because he had sex with Juliet without being married. Angelo is not an angel at all as we see from this behaviour. What does Angelo think? He could let a noble man live and marry his lover but besides this he violates the laws he is supposed to obey. For him it is “better to reign in hell than serve in heaven” as John Milton wrote in “Paradise Lost”. This phrase can connect with Angelo as if he was reigning at a peaceful society which doesn't violate the laws he should serve actually by obeying his laws. All these elements create a dramatic atmosphere by which the audience would cry instead of laugh.

On the other hand we have Isabella who shows a very selfish attitude as she refuses to have sex with Angelo to release and save her brother – die once, rather than a sister dying forever. Her words can clearly indicate her thoughts and make the audience understand that she is not going to do such a thing.

The only “comic” elements after all these is that the Duke visits the city as a friar. This could make us laugh as we see the duke with other clothes and as we know that he is the duke and not a friar but this could be more a tragic irony. Some gestures of the duke, trying to pretend to be the friar can also make us laugh but this is more like a comic relief than an element that makes the play a comedy. This play could be considered as a continuous battle between justice and desire. We have to mention that this play was written for the Globe Theatre where many different people had the chance to watch. Rich, poor, lords and villagers all together watch the play. It is very normal for them to have different interpretations at some points. For example, at the battle between Angelo and Isabella a feminist reader would see the battle between the genders as nowadays intercourse without the woman’s willing is illegal. A marxist reader would see the battle between the classes as a rich man tries to make a woman from a lower class obey him.

This play is full of suspense and intrigues as we see towards the end of the play how Isabella with the Duke wants to mock Angelo and give him the head of a pirate instead of Claudio’s and make him sleep with his ex girlfriend Mariana, whom he left due to the absence of property. Comparing this with other plays of Shakespeare this has a happy end. Angelo marries Mariana and learns to obey the laws and all the other characters continue their lives happily.

Most of Shakespeare’s tragedies, like “Othello” and “Romeo & Juliet” have not a happy end. This play has a happy end but all the situations presented and the attitude of the main characters does not create an atmosphere that could make people laugh. Instead it makes us think and consider things like justice in their everyday lives. The situation becomes so depressive sometimes and a comic relief is required, something that doesn’t happen in normal comedy. On stage we saw people crying, trying to support themselves, their beliefs and trying to actually live. All these elements are not present in a comedy so it’s a mistake to consider this play a comedy, but we cannot fully classify it as a tragedy because it doesn’t follow the definition of tragedy given by the ancient Greeks fully.

Shakespeare may have wanted to confuse us about the genre of the play but the only sure thing is that he captivated our interest and touched on things useful even for today’s life. The best thing we learn from this play is that everything and everyone should be judged with the same measure.

93747 / 0026 Q13 22

Read the poem “The Visionary” by Emily Jane Bronte and Charlotte Bronte on page 11 of the Source Booklet.

Explore the ways in which determination is presented in this poem and one other poem from your prescribed list.

In your answer you must consider relevant contextual factors.

“The Visionary” by Emily Jane Bronte and Charlotte Bronte depicts the speaker waiting for her lover to visit her. Through the context of the cold winter night with the silent warm house, a secure inner mood is created which withstands the wildness of the storm outside. The speaker as she sets the scene shows determination and strong faith in her love, and although she is waiting she is actively protecting and securing the secret relationship. A similar determination in love is portrayed in Robert Browning’s “Love in a Life” where the speaker continuously searches for his lover through their house, seemingly never giving up.

The speaker in “The Visionary” is waiting for her lover to visit her, coming through the heavy snow, but she is not restless or helpless. While her lover’s part is to cross the snow and endure the wild weather, the speaker too fulfils her part by creating a warm and safe place for them to meet. Hence the juxtaposition between the wild storm in the first stanza which “bends the groaning trees” and the cheerful hearth of the house serves to show how strong their love is to first overcome the storm and to then leave the storm outside. The wind, which is personified in the first stanza, gains a fierceness, only to be completely blocked out of the house: “Not one shivering gust creeps through pane or door”, and the elements may parallel the prying nature of society and the safe and enclosed faith of their love. Thus, nature and the domestic become metaphors which hint at the development of the poem in which the speaker directly addresses society not to pry into her relationship.

The speaker refuses to reveal the identity of her lover and hints at a both spiritual and physical presence by using words such as “wing” or “secret power” as well as words such as “tracks”. As neither of the Bronte sisters are known to have had such relationships, the poem may describe a more spiritual love and experience.

On the other hand, Browning’s “Love in a Life” may be less ambiguously interpreted – it seems to be about Browning’s own relationship with his wife, Elizabeth Barrett Browning. It describes his exploration of her as well as his life with her through the metaphor of searching through a house – “room after room” – to find her. The structure of the poem is such that its two stanzas are both expanding as the lines get longer and longer, reflecting both the expanding nature of the search as well as how the scope of discovering increases with time rather than decreases. Browning’s search is extremely active, and perhaps over violent, in the use of words such as “hunt” and “importune”. The speaker is looking for his lover, but is satisfied in the act of searching itself, as suggested by the enthusiastic tone which rises to excitement at the end of the second stanza. The speaker’s determination to find his lover is reflected in the poem’s repetitions such as “door succeeds door” which at once hint at the fatigue of the speaker but also his continuous search, never giving up. The line “Next time, herself! – not the trouble behind her” relays his eagerness on perceiving how close he is to his end, but also conveys the excitement of the search itself. As the search continues, frustration

in the tone turns into enthusiasm as Browning suggests that he may spend his entire life – even in “twilight” which suggests old age – discovering the woman he loves.

“The Visionary” contains a more obvious and abrupt change of tone as the speaker begins to address society directly in the third stanza with “Frown, my haughty sire!” The previously calm and gentle tone of the speaker becomes haughty, and hence displays the speaker’s confidence in her love to stand up so proudly against figures of societal norms. It is speculated that Charlotte Bronte was responsible for this stanza while Emily Bronte wrote the majority of the poem, as Charlotte is said to have heavily edited many of Emily’s poems published after her death. This would explain the sudden and large shift in tone which contrasts greatly with the hushed tone which concludes the poem. Nevertheless, it is a burst of power which the speaker proves to be capable of in order to protect her love from the prying eyes of society. The shameless attitude displayed here is unconventional especially for a woman of Victorian times and hence further emphasises the speaker’s faith in her love.

The burning of the lamp in “The Visionary” symbolises the constant love and truth of the speaker. It is first trimmed to be “the wanderer’s guiding star” and in the last stanza the speaker says “Burn, then, little lamp, glimmer straight and clear” which shows the reaffirmation of her unwavering love. It is proof of her love as it is what her lover follows every night to reach her, and also suggests fiery and passionate spirit beneath the speaker’s gentle and calm exterior.

Both poets write in the first person, which suits to express the speakers’ feelings directly, as in “Love in a Life” when the speaker says, “Heart, fear nothing, for, heart, thou shalt find her” and allow their determination to be intuitively expressed.

COMMENTS

Script A

A clear and straightforward opening paragraph tells us that the two poems for consideration show different attitudes towards grief: Bronte sees grief as something one should escape from whilst Keats in his *Ode to Melancholy* sees grief as an inevitable stage in life that we should experience and appreciate more.

This is a sound opening premise which gives us a clear point of comparison between two well chosen poems that would work well with this question on how grief is presented. It should be noted however that comparison itself is not an Assessment Objective specifically assessed in this paper. Elements of comparison can be interesting and, if well argued, can contribute to

the AO1 score. But in this case the urge to compare does lead the candidate to simplify issues later on in the essay.

We are then given some context - the fictional world of Gondal was an escape from grief, and there is a quick reference to Samuel Johnson who tells us that romantic poetry links pleasure and pain, as in Keats' Ode. This is a point which, in a fuller answer, might have been better developed. However there is some addressing of the context AO here and so far the essay has made a positive and quite confident start.

Some uncertainty of approach sets in when trying to explain pathetic fallacy. The general idea that the cold earth is being used metaphorically to represent separation is valid - "Time's all-wearing wave" is mentioned, though it would have been useful here to see that phrase being unpicked and analysed - some detail about imagery for example would have illustrated the point. The general feeling of the coldness of grief is illustrated by Bronte's words "like sun and heaven" which create a feeling of transcendency meaning that "even the metaphysical beings can't give her life back because it dies along with Brenzaida". Again there is something that could be developed here: this appreciation of what the poem has to say about grief is almost contradicted later on as the essay decides that the poem must be contrasted with Keats' embracing of grief - Bronte's speaker, we are told, has to "move on".

From here on the essay proves rather disappointing. We are told that a lighter tone is used in Keats' poem "as he uses a lot of Greek mythology". A simple comparison is made between the two poems, with Keats being "lively and warm" in contrast to Bronte's "dark, cold and mysterious". In fact the choice of poems which at first seemed apposite is now tending to draw out straightforward contrasts which overlook the nuances in the poems. This is particularly so with the Bronte poem as there are some misunderstandings: "Time heals everything" is not the simple message, nor is "drinking deep of that divinest anguish" a reference to alcohol. There are some further clichés that show the limitations of this reading of the poem - the poem is about how to "get over grief step by step." Again this is the result of the essay's trying too hard to make a reading of the Bronte poem to compare with Keats' indulgence in grief: the point missed is that, though Bronte's poem appears to be about self control and not giving in to despair, everything in the poem - its rhythms, its prosody, its anguish, tells us that the speaker yearns to share the grave with her beloved.

Despite the simplifications in the reading of the Bronte poem, the original premise - Keats embracing grief, and Bronte attempting to use will power to control it, produces a relevant answer - a clear response with knowledge of how meanings are shaped in texts, and should be placed in level 3 with a mark of 15.

Script B

The opening paragraph inspires confidence - here is a candidate who has a neat, clear minded approach - we are going to learn something. The paragraph which follows corrects us on the meaning of "closet" - it is not Gertrude's bedroom where the ghost appears, though some Freudian readers might like to think so. Imagery, especially disease imagery (the motif of sickness which peppers the play) is also referred to.

Relevant contextual points are raised, including references to *Amleth* (though *Amleth* is a predecessor of *Hamlet* rather than a “first draft”) and the fact that Shakespeare has moved away from the traditional rash revenger figure in his play. The essay addresses that part of the question which asks about sympathy – Hazlitt’s “we are Hamlet” is used as evidence. The “disturbed view of the world” is addressed by looking at the guards’ opening speeches which create the “uneasy mood” that characterises the rest of the play. There is some analysis of language looking at the “broken rhythms” of the guards’ opening speech and again there is some useful context material relating to England’s sensitivity to invasion from Spain. A conclusion is reached which fits well with the task required by the question - “in this paranoid time it is no wonder that Hamlet has succumbed to the cover of ‘an antic disposition’.”

An excellent concluding paragraph tells us that Hamlet’s madness “retaliates against the various causes of his madness rather than remaining a simple effect.”

This is a fairly short essay that covers all the assessment objectives confidently. It reaches level 5, the top band, because it is critical and evaluative: there is a sophistication in the writing here. The mark is 21.

Script C

This essay presents us with very broad and general introductory statements which nevertheless address the central concern: can such a disturbing play really be called a comedy?

Vienna, we are told, can remind us of Sodom. We are on the edge of something here, but the biblical allusions are not explored. Isabella’s name, meaning Devoted to God, is correct. Lucio is mentioned as comic relief. These points, though not followed through, are all valid. Though the essay does not have direct quotation, there is clear reference to the text when we are told that Angelo in the beginning refuses to take the place of the Duke.

The essay drifts into narrative but then again there are echoes of something more scholarly – the linking of Angelo to Lucifer and the reference to *Paradise Lost* suggest this, and there is again a reference to the text with the idea of a sister dying forever if she were to follow Angelo’s demands.

The problem with this essay is that complex ideas are hinted at but never followed through. The candidate appears to have seen a production in which the Duke entertained the audience in the process of dressing up as a friar. We then have statements about Marxist and Feminist readings of the play.

The overall result is that, despite references to potentially valid and relevant arguments, the points are never developed and there is no evidence they have been fully understood. Towards the end the essay tells us that “Angelo marries Mariana and learns to obey the laws and all the other characters continue their lives happily.”

This is a simple and reductive reading of the play. It is placed at the bottom of level 3 with a mark of 11.

SCRIPT D

This candidate chooses two poems which illustrate determination well: the shortened version of the Bronte poem beginning “Silent is the house” as it appears in the set anthology in which the speaker appears to be waiting for her lover, her muse, a mystical transcendental religious experience (it is never clear which) and Browning’s exuberant *Love in a Life*.

At first the essay establishes that the speaker in the Bronte poem is waiting for a lover – later on it is recognised that there are other possible interpretations. An excellent point is made when it is suggested that the elements of nature – the gust that attempts to creep “through pane or door” may “parallel the prying nature of society and the safe and enclosed faith of their love.”

Browning’s is seen as less ambiguous. Comparison is not itself specifically addressed in this question, but points about the speaker’s “active” search in contrast to Bronte’s waiting persona serve to extend the argument about determination. We are told that twilight, at the end of the poem, suggests old age. Although this answer is very sound on detecting the tone of both poems, an even fuller answer might have detected that mortality may be suggested at this point – we must get on, as time is running short – and this sits alongside the otherwise lively and optimistic tone of the poem.

Tone is however addressed well when it comes to “Frown, my haughty sire!” where it is suggested the speaker displays her confidence in her love to “stand up so proudly against figures of societal norms. “ We are told “the shameless attitude displayed here is unconventional especially for a woman of Victorian times”- this is an interesting contextual point, references to context being otherwise thin in this answer.

This is a sensitive and sophisticated response to both poems with clear analysis of language and absolute determination to answer the question on determination. Context points are its weakness - otherwise it is excellent in perception and analysis. It is placed in level 5 with a mark of 22.

FURTHER POINTS FOR *PREPARING TO TEACH* SESSION BASED ON THE BRONTE POEM DISCUSSED IN SAMPLE ESSAY “A”

These points refer in further detail to the sample essay A. They suggest ways in which teachers might guide students towards appreciating the tone of a poem, rather than taking at face value what the poem appears to say at a first reading.

A starting point might be to note there are two slightly different versions of this poem. The one more usually printed is the version the Bronte sisters published, removing all the Gondal references and calling this poem *Remembrance*. This is the volume that sold only two copies. The second is the version in the Edexcel set anthology, *English Romantic Verse* edited by David Wright. It follows the version in Emily Bronte’s own handwriting (interestingly in the penultimate stanza apparently it is impossible to tell from the writing whether the tomb is more than *mine* or *thine* (both of course make equal sense - the speaker wants to share the grave with her dead lover.) The title gives us the Gondal references - Rosina Alcona, speaking of the death of her lover / husband Julius of Brenzaida and the second stanza refers to the northern island of Angora.

It might be an interesting exercise to “spot the differences” with a class. Which version do you prefer? To help, the differences are italicised in the published version below. Is *all-severing* an improvement on *all-wearing* (one used the repetition of *sever*, the other the alliteration of the *w*)? The *sterner* desires and *darker* hopes of the handwritten version have become, rather more blandly, *other* hopes and desires.

The fact that the set anthology version gives us the Gondal references is a useful trigger for students writing about context – the tiny books and stories the Brontes made up as children. Several answers in June 2018 suggested that the fifteen wild Decembers in the poem referred to the fifteen years that have passed since Emily first wrote about Rosina and Julius - she was fourteen then and now, as a twenty nine year old, she has seen her sister die. No wonder the poem is full of images of childhood and growing up – the days of golden dreams have passed now; she has to wean her young soul from its yearning.

REMEMBRANCE (the version the Brontes published)

Cold in the earth—and the deep snow piled above thee,
Far, far removed, cold in the dreary grave!
Have I forgot, my only Love, to love thee,
Severed at last by Time's all-severing wave?

Now, when alone, do my thoughts no longer hover
Over the mountains, on *that northern* shore,
Resting their wings where heath and fern-leaves cover
Thy noble heart forever, ever more?

Cold in the earth—and fifteen wild Decembers,
From those brown hills, have melted into spring:

Faithful, indeed, is the spirit that remembers
After such years of change and suffering!

Sweet Love of youth, forgive, if I forget thee,
While the world's tide is bearing me along;
Other desires and *other* hopes beset me,
Hopes which obscure, but cannot do thee wrong!

No *later light* has lightened up my heaven,
No *second morn* has ever shone for me;
All my life's bliss from thy dear life was given,
All my life's bliss is in the grave with thee.

But, when the days of golden dreams had perished,
And even Despair was powerless to destroy,
Then did I learn how existence could be cherished,
Strengthened, and fed without the aid of joy.

Then did I check the tears of useless passion—
Weaned my young soul from yearning after thine;
Sternly denied its burning wish to hasten
Down to that tomb already more than mine.

And, even yet, I dare not let it languish,
Dare not indulge in memory's rapturous pain;
Once drinking deep of that divinest anguish,
How could I seek the empty world again?

R. ALCONA TO J. BRENZAIDA (our set anthology version, taken from Emily's
handwritten manuscript)

Cold in the earth—and the deep snow piled above thee!
Far, far removed, cold in the dreary grave!
Have I forgot, my Only Love, to love thee,
Severed at last by Time's all-wearing wave?

Now, when alone, do my thoughts no longer hover
Over the mountains, on Angora's shore,
Resting their wings where heath and fern-leaves cover
Thy noble heart for ever, ever more?

Cold in the earth—and fifteen wild Decembers
From those brown hills, have melted into spring -
Faithful indeed is the spirit that remembers
After such years of change and suffering!

Sweet Love of youth, forgive, if I forget thee
While the World's tide is bearing me along:
Stern desires and darker hopes beset me,

Hopes which obscure, but cannot do thee wrong.

No other sun has lightened up my heaven;
No other Star has ever shone for me:
All my life's bliss from thy dear life was given -
All my life's bliss is in the grave with thee.

But when the days of golden dreams had perished,
And even Despair was powerless to destroy,
Then did I learn how existence could be cherished,
Strengthened, and fed without the aid of joy.

Then did I check the tears of useless passion,
Weaned my young soul from yearning after thine;
Sternly denied its burning wish to hasten
Down to that tomb already more than mine!

And even yet, I dare not let it languish,
Dare not indulge in Memory's rapturous pain;
Once drinking deep of that divinest anguish,
How could I seek the empty world again?

The sample essay is limited by feeling a need to make a contrast with the other chosen poem, one which readily embraces grief. The point is made that Bronte's poem, on the contrary, aims to avoid succumbing to it and thereby giving way to despair.

Fair enough. But doesn't the poem actually say rather more than this – even contradicts itself in so doing? F. R. Leavis called this the best poem in the nineteenth century section of the *Oxford Book of English Verse*. He must have seen more in it than whoever it was who wrote this account online in the website Schmoop:

Instead of reading this elegy for the purpose of learning more about death, you can also read this poem for some tips on how best to bounce back from a bad breakup – or any sort of loss, really. If you think about it, breakups can feel an awful lot like a funeral. The person broke your heart, didn't seem to care about it, and then left you weepy and alone.

When someone we love dies, we tend to feel the same way – only we don't want to have to deal with the awkward run-in at the supermarket. Sometimes it's hard to check our "tears of useless passion" and move on, but Bronte's speaker has a great way of reminding us that existence can be strengthened without the joy we got from the one we loved. Despair doesn't have to destroy us completely, and we can still cherish our time on earth in different ways, especially when we make an effort to remember the good times and move on from the bad (Plus, it doesn't hurt to remember that there are other fish in the sea.)

There are other points of view of course which are credited in this exam and Schmoop could possibly be one of them. There are other fish in the sea? Evidence? “Forgive if I forget thee... other hopes and other desires beset me.” You could argue that the speaker has met someone else, perhaps through online dating, though it would mean ignoring the line “No later light / no other sun has lighted up my heaven” and the fact that this poem was written in the nineteenth century. The phrasing in the handwritten version further eliminates any idea that “other desires” might refer to any other “fish in the sea” – the desires are *sterner* and the hopes are *darker*. And of course it overlooks the terrible oxymoronic clash in the idea of cherishing a joyless existence, where *joy* and *cherish* that should sit together result in mere *existence*. Yes, one must go on, because to give way to grief would be to submit to despair and the thanatos that temptingly stalks its way all through this poem.

If only candidate A (or the authors of Schmoop for that matter) would actually *listen* to the poem. Although the rhythm is iambic, that heavy stress on the first syllable in the first three stanzas gives us the unbearable weight of grief. Then suddenly it changes: “Sweet Love of youth, forgive if I forget thee”: the iambs sweetly and perfectly come off the page as Rosina Alcona addresses the love of her life with touching directness, as if he were still alive. But she is wrong. The stern denials, the checking of tears of useless passion, tell us of a life in which mighty opposites have fought each other – and do so in the poem, which of course gives the poem its strength. The gloriously seductive imagery which surrounds despair (candidate A might have noticed this similarity with Keats’ wonderful indulgence in grief) - “drinking deep of that divinest anguish” – in contrast with stern denial, a world without any other *Sun* or *Star* (how much better this is than *light* or *morn* of the published version!) and of course, in the final devastating rhetorical question – “How could I seek the empty world again?”

Back to the question in the exam - explore the ways in which grief is presented: here it is a conflict between stern denial and the desire to give way. In terms of context we need to remind ourselves of religious attitudes at the time the Brontes were writing – life is God given, existence must be cherished. Suicide is the sin of despair, the reverse side of pride. This poem comes dangerously close to it.